## **Exhibit D**

## ROBERT LEE - 09/14/2017

Pages 2..5

1		Dome 7	Page 4
1		Page 2	ROBERT LEE
3	APPEARANCES	2	ROBERT LEE,
4		3	being first duly sworn by Jowell Falsetta,
	DEALY GILBERSTEIN & BRAVERMAN, LLP	4	a Notary Public of the State of New York,
5	Attorneys for Plaintiff	5	was examined and testified as follows:
	025 Broadway, Stite 1405	6	EXAMINATION BY MR. LEBOWITZ:
7	New York, New York 10007 BY: LAWRENCE J. LEBOWITZ, 250	7	Q. Good morning, Mr. Lee.
8	-and-	8	A. Good morning.
9	ABIJAMS, FENSTERMAN, FENSTERMAN, EISMAN	9	O. I know I have introduced
	FORMATO, PERRARA WOLF & CARONE, LLP	10	
10	Attorneys for Plaintiff One Motro Tech Center, Suite 1703		myself a few minutes ago and we chatted
11	Brooklyn, New York 11201	11	but my name is Larry Lebowitz. I am
12	BY JOHN S CAHALAN, ESQ	12	the attorney for Mr. Slinin in this
13		13	litigation. I am here this morning to
14	BOJES, SHILLER & FLEXNER, LLP,	14	ask you some questions with respect to
7.5	Attorneys for Defendant	15	various transactions related to the
	575 Lexington Avenue 7th Floor	16	purchase and sale of various aircraft
10	New York, New York 10022	17	that took place between 2006 and 2012
# N	BY EAREN DYER, ESQ (KDYER@BSFLLP CCM)	18	or 2013. Couple of ground rules well
16	(AD) EX (BSF DDP CC.)	19	let me begin by asking, have you ever
19		20	been deposed before?
	ALSO PRESENT:	21	A. No.
20	Eduard Sl_min	22	Q. I'm going to be asking you a
71		23	number of questions. If at some point
23		24	in time I ask you a question and you
24		25	don't understand it, please let me
25			don't diderstand it, prease let me
		Page 3	Page 5
3		1	ROBERT LEE
	STIPLIATIONS	2	know. I'll be happy to rephrase it.
3		3	Hopefully we won't have to do that but
	IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED by	4	you never know.
4	and between the attorneys for the respective parties hereto, that this	5	If at any time you want to take
S	examination may be sworn to before any	6	a break, we can take a break. The only
	Notary Public	7	caveat is if there is an open question,
δ		8	I'll ask you to answer the question and
	IT is FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED that the filing and certification of the said	9	then we can take a break. I think
	examination shall be waived	10	pretty much that is it for the moment.
1		11	Would you be kind enough to
	IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED that	12	state your address for the record?
9	all objections to questions, except as to the form of the question, shall be	13	A. It is 305 Roe Hampton
3.0	reserved for tind tabo of trial.	14	Avenue, Toronto, Ontario, Canada.
11		15	Q. Mr. Lee, there is person
12			
13		16	sitting to your immediate right, that
15		17	is Ms. Dyer of course.
16		18	Is she representing you here
3.7		19	today?
16		20	A. Yes.
3 C		21	Q. So then I'll add one more
21		22	caveat which is, if you wish to consult
2.2		23	with Ms. Dyer, of course that is your
23		24	privilege. But again if there is an
24		25	open question, I'll ask that you answer

DTI Court Reporting Solutions - New York

```
Page 14
                                                                                    Page 16
               ROBERT LEE
                                               1
                                                             ROBERT LEE
                Is it fair to say that is
                                                              Can you define closely held
 2
                                               2
          Q.
                                                        Α.
     how you segued into working for
 3
                                               3
                                                   for me because it means different
 4
     Midland?
                                               4
                                                   things in different jurisdictions?
 5
          Α.
                It would be fair.
                                               5
                                                        0.
                                                              Your point is well taken.
 6
                Do you know an individual
                                               6
                                                         Who are the shareholders of
          0.
 7
     named Alex Shnaider?
                                               7
                                                   Midland Canada?
 В
          A
                T do.
                                               8
                                                      A. Alex Shnaider.
                Did Mr. Shnaider hold any
 9
          ο.
                                               9
                                                        ο.
                                                              With respect to Midland
     role at Midland Canada?
10
                                              10
                                                   Resources, based on your prior answer,
11
          A.
                Yes.
                                              11
                                                   would it be correct to say that Mr.
                                                   Shnaider is a 50 percent owner of
12
          ο.
                Can you tell me what it is,
                                              12
13
     please?
                                              13
                                                   Resources?
14
          A.
                He is the president.
                                              14
                                                       Α.
                                                            Ultimate beneficial.
15
          ο.
                I believe you said that
                                              15
                                                              So now I'll ask you, can you
16
     Midland Canada is a corporation; is
                                              16
                                                  tell me what you mean when you utilize
17
     that correct?
                                              17
                                                   that term ultimate beneficial?
18
         Α.
               Yes.
                                              18
                                                        A. There is a structure in
                Is it a publicly traded
19
          Q.
                                              19
                                                   place that is not uncommon in these
20
     corporation?
                                              20
                                                   circumstances and he is at the end of
21
         A.
                                              21
                                                   that structure.
22
          Q.
                Closely held?
                                              22
                                                        Q.
                                                              So when we get to the desk
                                                  where it says the buck stops here,
23
                MS. DYER: Objection to
                                              23
                                                   Mr. Shnaider is sitting at that desk?
24
          the form.
                                              24
                                                              MS. DYER: Objection.
25
               Do you know whether or not
                                              25
                                      Page 15
                                                                                    Page 17
              ROBERT LEE
                                                             ROBERT LEE
     it was a closely held corporation?
                                               2
                                                               MR. LEBOWITZ: Withdrawn.
 2
                MS. DYER: Same objection.
                                                              Can you tell me who is the
                                               3
                                                        Q.
 3
                                                   other if you know, the other beneficial
                You could answer. So that
 4
                                               4
     we understand, Ms. Dyer can object to
                                                   owner of Resources?
                                               5
 5
     form. It is an objection that she
                                                               MS. DYER:
                                                                           Just objection
 6
                                               6
     places on the record. But unless she
                                               7
                                                        to the form But he could
 8
    has some other objection which she
                                               В
                                                        answer. I don't know, I think it
    would voice, you would have to answer
                                                        presumes there might be another.
                                               9
1.0
     the question.
                                              10
                                                        0.
                                                              Is there another beneficial
11
                MS. DYER: Mr. Lee is
                                              11
                                                   owner of Resources?
12
          aware that I will throw myself on
                                                        A.
                                                             Yes, there is.
                                              12
13
          the court reporter if he should
                                              13
                                                              Can you tell me, who is it?
                                                        Q.
14
         not answer the question. Off the
                                              14
                                                        A.
                                                              It is a guy called Edward
:15
                                                  Shyfrin.
          record.
                                              15
16
                 (Off the record.)
                                              16
                                                              Does Mr. Shyfrin have any
                                                        0.
17
                MS DYER: Mr. Lee is
                                              17
                                                   involvement in or ownership in --
18
         aware the objection to form is
                                              18
                                                   withdrawn. Never mind.
19
          something that he will continue
                                              19
                                                        Let me now ask you, do you have
20
          to answer unless I very
                                              20
                                                  any familiarity with an entity known as
21
          specifically instruct him to
                                              21
                                                  Challenger Aircraft Company Limited?
22
         answer. Don't worry Madam court
                                              22
                                                       A.
                                                             I do.
23
         reporter, I will not do that but
                                              23
                                                        Q. First can you tell me what
24
          it will be very clear.
                                              24
                                                  is your familiarity with that entity?
                                              25
                                                             It was a subsidiary of
25
               So --
```

DTI Court Reporting Solutions - New York
1-800-325-3376 www.deposition.com

```
Page 22
                                                                                   Page 24
               ROBERT LEE
                                                            ROBERT LEE
     incorporate some companies in order to
                                              2
                                                       A.
                                                           I believe that it was Alex's
     purchase and sell aircraft.
 3
                                              3
                                                  birthday party in 2008.
                                                     Q. Was there a particular
 4
          Q.
               Did he tell you any of the
     underlying, any other facts with
                                                  reason that two companies were
 5
                                              5
 6
     respect to the purchase or sale of
                                              6
                                                  established as opposed to simply
 7
     these aircraft?
                                              7
                                                  establishing one company?
 8
                 MS. DYER: Objection to
                                              8
                                                       A. In fact we established three
 9
         the form but you could answer if
                                              9
                                                  at the time and it was to ring fence
10
         you can.
                                             10
                                                  liability, it was to isolate
                                             11
                                                  liabilities based on the concept of
11
         Α.
               He told me some more
     underlying facts.
                                             12
                                                  corporate limited liability.
12
13
              What were the underlying
                                             13
                                                             So you mentioned a third
         Q.
                                                       0.
                                                 company which was created, would that
14
     facts that he told you with respect to
                                             14
15
     the purchase and sale of aircraft?
                                             15
                                                  be at or about the same time?
16
               T don't recall precisely but 16
         Α.
                                                       A .
                                                             Yes.
                                             17
17
     it would have been that he had a
                                                             Can you tell me what the
                                                       0.
18
     business opportunity to purchase
                                             18
                                                 name of that company was, if you
    aircraft at reasonable prices based on
                                             19
19
                                                  recall?
                                                             I don't recall it right now
20
    his relationship with the manufacturer. 20
                                                       A.
21
          And that there was an
                                             21
                                                  but it was similar. So it was
22
    expectation that there would be an
                                             22
                                                  Challenger -- something along those
23
     opportunity to resell those aircraft at 23
                                                  lines.
24
    greater prices, at a different risk
                                             24
                                                             Did you at any time hold any
                                                       0.
25
    profile.
                                                  position in the CAC company?
                                     Page 23
                                                                                  Page 25
              ROBERT LEE
                                              1
                                                            ROBERT LEE
 2
              So sitting to my left is a
                                              2
                                                      A.
                                                            You mean as an officer of
     gentleman, a rather handsome gentleman,
                                              3
                                                  the company?
     distinguished, do you know him?
                                              4
                                                       Q.
                                                             As an officer, director?
 5
         A. I have seen him before.
                                              5
                                                       A.
                                                             No, I didn't.
 6
         Q.
               You know him as Eduard
                                              6
                                                       Q.
                                                             And did you at any time hold
 7
     Slinin; correct?
                                              7
                                                  any position as an officer, director of
 8
        A. Yes.
                                              8
                                                 CL 850?
 9
         Q.
               And obviously you know he is
                                             9
                                                       A.
                                                             No, I didn't.
                                             10
     the plaintiff in this case?
10
                                                       Q.
                                                             Were you ever employed by
11
         A. I do.
                                             11
                                                  either of those companies?
12
         Ď.
               And at the time in 2007 when 12
                                                       A.
                                                             No, I wasn't.
    Mr. Shnaider asked to you create CAC
13
                                             13
                                                       0.
                                                             Do you know who, who was the
    and CL 850, did he mention that
                                             14
                                                  ultimate -- withdrawn.
14
                                             15
15
    Mr. Slinin was in any way involved in
                                                       Do you know who the ultimate
    what these transactions were intended
16
                                             16
                                                 beneficial owner of CAC was?
17
                                             17
                                                     A.
                                                            Yes, it was Alex Shnaider.
                                             18
                                                            What about CL 850?
18
                MS. DYER: I'm going to
                                                       Q.
                                             19
                                                            The same.
19
         object to the form but you could
                                                      A.
20
         answer
                                             20
                                                       0.
                                                             Did do you know whether or
         A.
              I don't recall whether he
                                             21 not Mr. Slinin ever had any interest
21
                                             22 whatsoever in either CL 850 or CAC?
    mentioned it at that time. At that
22
                                                             MS. DYER: Just I don't
    time I had not met Mr. Slinin.
23
                                             23
                                             24
24
               By the way do you recall
                                                      mean to be a pain, if you could
         Q.
                                            25
25
    when you first did meet Mr. Slinin?
                                                     take them one at a time.
```

DTI Court Reporting Solutions - New York

www.deposition.com

```
Page 26
                                                                                  Page 28
               ROBERT LEE
                                                            ROBERT LEE
 2
               Do you know whether or not
                                              2
                                                             No, it is not.
 3
     Mr. Slinin ever had any interest in
                                              3
                                                             Do you know whose signature
                                                       0.
 4
                                              4
                                                  that is?
 5
               Can you define what you mean
                                              5
                                                       Λ.
 6
     by interest?
                                                       Q.
                                                             Can you tell me whose it is?
 7
          Q. Any indicia of ownership or
                                              7
                                                             It is the signature of a
                                                      A.
 8
     right to share in the profits or
                                              8
                                                  co-worker of mine by the name of Daniel
 9
     losses, any indicia of ownership?
                                              9
                                                  Tilis.
10
         A.
               No.
                                             10
                                                       0.
                                                            And who would have
11
          Q. Any right to share in the
                                                 authorized Mr. Tilis to execute this
                                             11
12
     profits or losses?
                                             12
                                                  document on behalf of Challenger?
13
                                                              MS. DYER: Objection to
                                                      the form.
14
               How about with respect to CL 14
15
     850, with respect to Mr. Slinin, any
                                                      Q. If you know.
                                             15
16
    interest in ownership?
                                                             I don't recall precisely but
                                             16
                                                  I expect it was me.
17
         A. No.
                                             17
18
         Q. Any interest in share of the 18
                                                             And before having signed
19
     profits or loss?
                                                  this contract, would you have spoken to
                                             19
20
         A. No.
                                                 Mr. Shnaider about it?
                                             20
21
               Now did there come a time
                                                              MS. DYER:
                                                                         Objection to
                                             21
22
     that CAC or CL 850 entered into a
                                             22
                                                      the form.
23
    series of contracts for the purchase of 23
                                                      Q. You could answer.
24
    various airplanes?
                                             24
                                                             Before Mr. Tilis signed?
                                                      A.
25
         A. They did.
                                             25
                                                            Yes, let me rephrase it.
                                                      Q.
                                     Page 27
                                                                                  Page 29
              ROBERT LEE
1
                                              1
                                                           ROBERT LEE
 2
               I got a few contracts.
                                              2
                                                      You authorized Mr. Tilis to
                MR, LEBOWITZ: Let's go
 3
                                              3
                                                 execute the agreement?
         off the record for a second.
                                                            I don't recall precisely but
 4
                                              4
                                                     A.
                (Off the record.)
 5
                                              5
                                                 I expect so.
                MR. LEBOWITZ: Let's mark
 6
                                              6
                                                      0.
                                                            Would it be fair to say
 7
         this as Lee Exhibit 1.
                                              7
                                                 Mr. Tilis would not have executed it
 8
                (Aircraft purchase
                                                 without authority from either yourself
                                              8
                                                 or from some other person?
9
    agreement marked for
                                             9
10
    identification, Lee Exhibit 1.)
                                                           It would be fair.
                                             10
                                                      A.
11
             I am going to ask you to
                                                            So I'll ask you before you
                                             7.7
    take a look at that document and ask
                                                then authorized Mr. Tilis to execute
12
                                             12
13
    you if you recognize what it is.
                                             13
                                                 the agreement, would you have discussed
14
         A. Yes, I recognize what it is. 14
                                                 this contract with Mr. Shnaider?
15
              Can you tell me please what 15
                                                             MS. DYER: Objection to
         Q.
    you recognize it to be?
                                                      the form. You could answer.
16
                                             16
         A. It is an aircraft purchase
17
                                             17
                                                      A. It is -- I certainly
    agreement between Challenger Aircraft
18
                                            18
                                                 discussed this contract in general
19
    Company Limited as seller and Olave
                                             19
                                                 terms with Mr. Shnaider before it was
20
    Equities as buyer.
                                                 executed.
                                             20
21
         Q. I'm going to direct your
                                                            And prior to the execution
                                             21
                                                      0.
    attention in the first instance to page 22
                                                 of this contract, did you have any
    seven of nine. And ask you if under
                                             23
                                                discussions with Mr. Slinin?
    Challenger Aircraft Corporation, is
                                                            I don't recall.
                                             24
                                                      Α.
    that your signature?
                                             25
                                                            Do you know, did you --
```

DTI Court Reporting Solutions - New York
6 www.deposition.com

```
Page 30
                                                                                    Page 32
                                                             ROBERT LEE
               ROBERT LEE
                 MS. DYER:
                                               2
                                                  called Olave to purchase an 850 plane
                             Let me just
                                                  for $26 million, correct, that is what
          object to the form on the last
                                               3
 3
          question. Just to the extent it
                                               4
                                                   this contract says?
 4
                                                              Correct.
 5
          assumes that he authorized the
                                               5
                                                        A.
                                                              In the end the ultimate
          execution of the contract.
                                               6
                                                        0.
 6
                                                  Challenger was not selling this plane
 7
                 I am not sure that is
          consistent with the record but
                                               8
                                                  to a company it bought off the shelf
 8
                                                   and expecting to get $26 million from
 9
          please go ahead.
                                                   itself or another entity affiliated
             Do you have any knowledge of 10
10
                                                   with Midland; correct?
     whom or what Olave Equities Limited is? 11
11
                                                              MS. DYER:
                                                                          Objection.
12
         A.
               I do.
               Can you tell me what is your 13
                                                        Q.
                                                             You could answer.
13
14
     understanding of what it is?
                                              14
                                                        A.
                                                             That is correct.
                                                             And in the end -- withdrawn,
15
         A. It is one of a group of
                                              15
     other companies that were purchased off
                                                        Olave was purchased as a shell
16
                                             16
     the shelf, if you understand the
                                              17
                                                   company to ultimately be assigned to an
17
                                                   end purchaser, is that accurate, you
18
     expression in around the same time, in
                                              18
                                              19
                                                   could answer?
19
     around the same way.
20
         0.
               Was Olave a company that
                                              20
                                                              MR. LEBOWITZ:
                                                                             You could
21
                                              21
                                                        object.
    when you say purchased off the shelf,
22
    was it purchased by you -- when I say
                                              22
                                                              MS. DYER: Objection to
    you, I mean an entity. I don't mean
23
                                              23
                                                        the form.
24
    you personally but Midland or Midland
                                              24
                                                             I am not sure.
    Canada or Midland Resources?
                                              25
                                                              MR LEBOWITZ.
                                                                             I didn't
                                     Page 31
                                                                                   Page 33
1
              ROBERT LEE
                                              1
                                                             ROBERT LEE
 2
               Yes. As it was first
                                               2
                                                       mean to cut you off.
         Α.
 3
    ordered, yes.
                                               3
                                                              MS. DYER:
                                                                         No, no, I don't
 4
               And what was the ultimate
                                               4
                                                       mean to be difficult and 1 don't
         0.
5
    disposition of that entity Olave going
                                               5
                                                       have a -- but when you say Olave
 6
                                              6
                                                        was purchased as a shell company,
 7
                MS. DYER:
                            Objection to
                                                        I think if you asked if it was a
 8
         the form.
                                               8
                                                        shell company. I think if you
9
         Q.
               Do you understand my
                                              9
                                                        took the word purchase out.
                                                        Q. Was Olave a shell company
10
    question?
                                              10
               When you say disposition,
                                              11
                                                  that was ultimately going to be
1)
         A.
                                                  assigned to the end purchaser of the
12
    can you define --
                                              12
13
         Q.
               Yes, well was it not the
                                              13
                                                  plane?
    intent of Midland or the entity that
                                                       A. Broadly speaking, yes. I
14
                                              14
15
    purchased Olave off the shelf, to use
                                              15
                                                  have a little problem with the word
    your term, did it assign its shares or
                                                  assigned because in everyday parlance
1.6
                                              16
17
    ownership interest to a third person?
                                              17
                                                  if that was correct, meaning it was
                MS. DYER: Objection to
                                                  allocated, there was no, in that case
18
                                              18
                                                  legal assignment of rights. But there
         the form.
                                              19
               You can answer.
                                                  was a transfer of shares as 1
20
               At the time, I'm not certain 21
                                                  understand it.
    that was the intention but ultimately
                                              22
                                                      Q. So we are clear and please
    it was the intention.
                                              23
                                                  correct me if my statement is incorrect
             Let's be clear, Challenger
                                              24
                                                  with your understanding.
    was signing a contract with a company
                                              25
                                                        Ultimately, the ownership
```

DTI Court Reporting Solutions - New York
76 www.deposition.com

```
Page 36
                                     Page 34
               ROBERT LEE
                                                            ROBERT LEE
                                                  never used that.
     interest of Olave would be transferred
                                                             That is fine.
 3
     to the end buyer of the airplane;
                                                        Do you know who the ultimate end
     correct?
                                                  buyer, the individual end buyer of this
          A.
                Correct.
               And the end buyer would take
                                                  airplane was supposed to be?
 6
          0.
     title to the airplane in the name of
                                                       A.
                                                            I don't --
                                                             I'll direct your attention
                                                       Q.
 9
               When you say would, they did
                                                  to the last page.
        A.
     not take --
                                             10
                                                       Α.
                                                             I don't know. I never met
10
         O. I understand but if the
11
                                             11
                                                  Mr. Oleg Sheikhametov
12
     contract, this one as well as all the
                                             12
                                                       Q.
                                                             Do you know who was that
13
     others if I am correct, we have not
                                             13
                                                  introduced Mr. Sheikhametov to this
     gotten there so let me withdraw that.
                                             14
                                                  purchase?
14
          This contract, had it been
                                             15
                                                             I believe it was Mr. Slinin.
15
                                                              MR. JEBOWITZ: Okay, let's
    fulfilled, the anticipation of its
                                             16
16
     execution would have been that the
                                             17
                                                       mark this document as Lee 2
17
18
     shares of Olave would have been
                                             18
                                                              (Aircraft purchase
7.9
     transferred to the end buyer, who would 19
                                                  agreement marked for
20
     have taken title to the airplane under
                                                  identification, Lee Exhibit 2.)
                                             20
21
                                             21
                                                           I am going to ask you to
     the Olave name?
22
                MS. DYER:
                                             22
                                                  take a look at that and let me know if
                           Objection to
23
          the form.
                                             23
                                                  you recognize what that document is?
24
         A. That, okay, that is correct.
                                                      A. This is also an aircraft
    It was important to us to use these
                                                  purchase agreement, in this case
              ROBERT LEE
                                                            ROBERT LEE
     contracts to set out terms under which
                                              2
                                                  between Bombardier, Inc. as seller and
 3
    ultimate beneficial transfer of title
                                              3
                                                  CL 850 Aviation Holdings Limited as the
     to the aircraft on delivery would be
                                                  buyer.
 4
                                              4
     transferred.
                                              5
                                                             Now I'm going to ask you to
 5
 6
         And I was informed at the time
                                              6
                                                  take a look at page seven of mine of
    that the end buyers and the people
                                              7
                                                  this contract and ask you if your
 8
     working on the purchase side didn't
                                              8
                                                  signature appears on this page?
     have the capabilities to put this kind
                                              9
                                                    Α.
                                                             My signature does appear on
    of structure in place. But it was a
                                             10
                                                  this page
10
     prerequisite of the seller, the terms
                                             11
                                                     Q.
                                                             That would be as the
                                                  authorized signatory for CL 850?
12
     were set out clearly, well as clearly
                                             12
     as possible. And that is why this
                                             13
                                                      Α.
                                                            Correct.
13
     structure was adopted.
                                             14
                                                       Ο.
                                                             Do you know who signed this
14
                                                  contract on behalf of Bombardier?
15
         Q.
               So are you familiar with the 15
16
     term turn key operation?
                                             16
                                                      λ.
                                                           I don't know. Although I
                                                  have a pretty good idea, I can't see
17
         A. I have heard it before.
                                             17
                                                  his name written here. It is only his
               In effect this was
18
                                             18
     essentially a turn key operation, was
19
                                             19
                                                  title.
20
     it not, wasn't that the way it was set
                                             20
                                                       Q.
                                                             Do you have a recollection
21
                                             21
                                                  of who it was?
22
                                                      Δ
                                                             It is likely to be Frank
                MS. DYER: Objection to
                                             22
23
                                                  Ercolanese.
          the form.
                                             23
               I am not familiar enough
                                                            Now would you take a look at
24
                                                     ο.
                                             24
25
    with the term turn key operation. We
                                             25
                                                  the date this contract was signed, you
```